



LACTLD Report on ICANN70

Virtual Community Forum
22-25 March 2021



lactld

Rambla República de México 6125
Montevideo, Uruguay
+598 2 604 22 22

Contents

Introduction	3
Virtual ccTLD News Sessions	3
ccNSO Members Meeting	5
Governance session	5
Q&A session with the ccTLD-related ICANN Board members	5
ccTLDs and the Future	6
Internet Governance Liaison Committee (IGLC) Meeting	8
Other sessions of interest to the ccTLD community	8
LAC Space	8
Discussions on DNS Abuse at ICANN70	9
CPH DNS Abuse Work Group Community Outreach	9
GAC Discussion on DNS Abuse Mitigation	10

Introduction

The LACTLD Report on ICANN70 reviews the main sessions of interest to the ccTLD community, held at ICANN70 Virtual Community Forum. The document also covers the Virtual ccTLD News Sessions organized by the ccNSO prior to the Public Meeting.

The ccNSO program at ICANN70 addressed issues of relevance to ccTLD managers and facilitated ongoing discussions. The governance session organized during the ccNSO Members Meeting provided an opportunity to review and evaluate the mechanisms that currently govern the Supporting Organization's operations. Additionally, the ccNSO community was able to examine and discuss emerging trends, collaboration experiences and the future of the Internet and its infrastructure in a session on ccTLDs and the future.

ccNSO members also participated in an interactive session with ICANN Directors and in an open discussion on digital sovereignty, organized by the Internet Governance Liaison Committee (IGLC).

At ICANN70, the ccNSO Council appointed new members to its leadership team. Alejandra Reynoso, researcher and developer at the .GT Domain Registry, was appointed Chair of the ccNSO Council. In addition, Pablo Rodríguez, Executive Vice President of Puerto Rico Top Level Domain, and Jordan Carter, Chief Executive of InternetNZ, were designated as Vice Chairs. The ccNSO also renewed its Councilors from the Latin America and Caribbean region: Jenifer López, Manager of NIC Panama, was appointed Councilor and Margarita Valdés, Legal and Commercial Director at NIC Chile, stepped down after completing her third term as a member of the ccNSO Council.

Virtual ccTLD News Sessions

The Virtual News Sessions were held during the Prep Week leading up to the ICANN70 Virtual Community Forum. Presentations by ccNSO members shared innovative actions and projects for the ccTLD community around technological sovereignty, sustainability, Universal Acceptance and the promotion of online presence.

The first Virtual News Session featured two updates from LACTLD members. First, Lito Ibarra (.sv) reviewed the .sv's 25-year history since the first connection to the Internet in El Salvador. His presentation also described the registry's current initiatives and projects and provided a number of key insights into the role and responsibilities of ccTLDs in their local communities. Secondly, Isabel Cristina De Ávila Benítez (.co) commented on the changes in the management of the registry and presented the new strategy of the Ministry of Information Technologies and Communications (MinTIC) around the ccTLD and Internet governance in

Colombia. She informed that the MinTIC is currently in charge of the design of public policies related to the promotion and use of the .co domain with the aim of supporting the economic reactivation and bridging the digital divide in the country. Isabel Cristina De Ávila Benítez (.co) also described the actions and projects that have been implemented to achieve these objectives and boost the online presence of Colombian SMEs and entrepreneurs.

The managers of .au and .by / .бел also shared their updates at the first Virtual News Session organized by the ccNSO. Alena Belskaya (.by / .бел) reported on the .by / .бел charity auctions, registration levels and main results achieved in 2020. On the other hand, Steph Viljoen (.au) offered a presentation on auDA's approach to compliance and complaints handling.

The second Virtual News Session covered regional initiatives, projects and campaigns carried out by ccNSO members. Bernhart Farras Sukandar (.in) presented the process of developing and implementing an in-house system for registry management. The presentation reviewed the analysis process conducted by PANDI, manager of .in, and examined the main benefits and requirements related to technological sovereignty in the management of a ccTLD.

Presentations from .rw and .ru / .рф expanded the discussions during the update session. Grace Ingabire (.rw) shared the campaign launched by RICTA, manager of .rw, to support the digitization of businesses in Rwanda. The presentation offered by Maria Kolesnikova (.ru / .рф) assessed what is the involvement and readiness of ccTLDs in the promotion of Universal Acceptance.

The second Virtual News Session closed with a discussion on ccTLD sustainability. Giovanni Seppia (.eu) and Arnaud Recko (.be) explained how some CENTR members have been working with other organizations on a carbon footprint policy. This policy proposes four steps for sustainable registry management: calculate the organization's carbon footprint, reduce, compensate, and communicate your environmental efforts/actions. The speakers reported that CENTR is currently developing a measurement model and performance indicators. The first phase of this project will provide a set of baseline measures and suggestions on how to set up a sustainability plan in a ccTLD.

[Session recordings and slides](#)

ccNSO Members Meeting

Governance session

The ccNSO governance session continued the discussions that had been initiated at ICANN69. The main purpose was to review and evaluate whether it is necessary to update the Supporting Organization's governance mechanisms, rules and processes so that they respond to the current practices and needs of its members.

The ccNSO is currently governed by the ICANN Bylaws, the ccNSO Rules adopted in 2004, and the operational Guidelines approved by the Council after consultation with the community. Each of these governing rules can be modified through separate processes and by meeting specific approval and participation requirements. In addition, the ccNSO is currently organized and operates according to a set of principles defined in 2004 to ensure the transparency, openness and bottom-up nature of the Supporting Organization.

During the session, participants reviewed issues that could potentially be evaluated or incorporated into future ccNSO Rules. These issues included: Council voting ratification procedures, amendment mechanisms for the Internal Rules and Guidelines, ccNSO's quorum, Council resolutions, electronic voting, establishment and functioning of Committees, removal of Councilors and/or Council, termination of ccNSO membership, among others.

ccNSO members shared their ideas about the issues that should be addressed in the Internal Rules review and update process. Some of the issues raised during the discussion were the appropriate behavior of ccNSO members and Councilors, the election of ICANN Board members nominated by the Supporting Organization, the review mechanism for Council decisions, and the distinction between the roles of ccNSO members and ccNSO Councilors.

At the end of the session, the ccNSO Secretariat announced a call for volunteers to work on the process of revising and updating the Internal Rules. The draft version of the new ccNSO Rules is expected to be presented during ICANN71. The proposed new set of Operating Procedures and Rules for the Supporting Organization would then be presented at ICANN72.

[Session recording](#)

Q&A session with the ccTLD-related ICANN Board members

The session with ICANN Board members covered three major topics: community networking after the return to face-to-face meetings; reviews; and prioritization in ICANN's work process. The meeting was attended by Lito Ibarra, Patricio Poblete, Nigel Roberts, Danko Jevtovic and Becky Burr. Also, Board Chair Maarten

Botterman and Vice Chair León Sánchez joined the Q&A session with ccNSO members.

ICANN Directors noted that the face-to-face interaction that takes place beyond the sessions is of great importance for the work of the community. Therefore, they suggested strengthening cross-community socialization and bringing in newcomers as soon as the face-to-face or hybrid Public Meetings return. In addition, they emphasized that the improvements that have been implemented in virtual participation should be maintained in order to include all community members who are unable to attend in person.

The discussion with the Board of Directors addressed ICANN reviews. Participants raised the need to reassess the value of the organizational reviews to the community, the efficiency of the process, the number of recommendations submitted, the frequency of the reviews, and their associated costs in terms of resources, time and volunteer efforts.

ICANN Board members also focused on prioritization needs in the face of the significant number of recommendations that require implementation. On the one hand, they stressed the importance of finding the right mechanism to communicate with the community in order to understand what the priorities are and how they should be organized. On the other hand, they discussed the proposal for a prioritization mechanism as recommended in ICANN's third Accountability and Transparency Review (ATRT3).

[Session recording](#)

ccTLDs and the Future

The session on ccTLDs and the future examined trends, cooperation experiences and a series of strategic approaches from three ccNSO members: .in, .nl and .br. It also offered key reflections on the future of the Internet, its properties and infrastructure.

The session opened with a keynote presentation by Olaf Kolkman, Principal - Internet Technology, Policy, and Advocacy at the Internet Society. His presentation looked at the future of the Internet and the impact that new regulations could have on the network infrastructure. Olaf Kolkman explained that today's government discussions are focused on a number of societal issues and the presence and operation of large companies on the Internet. However, these discussions do not address issues related to the preservation of the infrastructure and properties that make the Internet a network of networks providing end-to-end connectivity.

To introduce these properties, Olaf Kolkman presented the framework called '[the Internet Way of Networking](#)'. This tool identifies critical network properties and provides a model for assessing the impact of policy or regulatory proposals on the Internet. Olaf Kolkman reported that the toolkit 'the Internet Way of Networking' is currently being expanded. As the Internet continues to be built, the Internet Society team is identifying which other properties support the optimal development of the network and prevent its fragmentation. This toolkit will allow the community to assess the impact of upcoming proposals or measures to be implemented.

After the opening presentation, Roelof Meijer (.nl), Anil Kumar Jain (.in) and Frederico Neves (.br) shared different views on the present and future of their registries. The panelists stressed the importance of maintaining avenues of communication and collaboration with key stakeholders: customers, governments, local entities, ISPs, IXPs and regional ccTLD communities. They argued that registries should focus their attention on the service provided to registrants and on fostering a close engagement with the local community. In addition, .nl, .in and .br managers discussed how they cooperate and communicate with governments, especially on issues related to the stable, secure and resilient operation of the registry. Collaboration in regional organizations was also emphasized by the panelists with a focus on research, development and infrastructure sharing. Frederico Neves (.br) presented the LACTLD Anycast Cloud as an example of collaboration driven by the regional ccTLD community in Latin America and the Caribbean.

During the session, the panelists from .nl, .in and .br explored a number of emerging trends identified in their local communities. The discussion covered topics such as Universal Acceptance; new gTLDs and GeoTLDs; local policies; digital sovereignty or strategic digital autonomy; among others. Also, they discussed operational stability, growing security threats and their impact on costs, R&D and ccTLD collaboration efforts.

Frederico Neves (.br) spoke about the benefits of domains in terms of security, reliability and autonomy, in contrast to other identifiers based on *walled gardens*, especially on platforms and social networks.

Finally, .nl and .br managers expressed some concerns related to sustainable growth post-COVID-19. Due to the effects of the recession on small businesses, a decrease in the levels of registrations and renewals is expected in the coming years.

[Session recording I](#)

[Session recording II](#)

Internet Governance Liaison Committee (IGLC) Meeting

The Internet Governance Liaison Committee (IGLC) meeting examined the concept of digital sovereignty. Pierre Bonis (.fr), IGLC Chair, reported that IGLC members have recently been analyzing issues related to this topic with the aim of providing methods and tools that could be useful to the ccTLD community. In addition, they have proposed different categories to frame the discussions on digital sovereignty.

Participants discussed the proposed categories and the definition of digital sovereignty. The debate addressed the distinction between digital sovereignty and cyber sovereignty; local traffic management; users' freedom of choice; politicization and the role of governments; the promotion of IXPs; among other issues.

During the session, some participants shared examples of initiatives and actions that could be related to the digital sovereignty debate. Peter Van Roste, CENTR's General Manager, reported that some European ccTLDs have been participating in efforts to enable the operation of identification systems across countries. Also, Allan MacGillivray (.ca) shared that CIRA has taken a central role in the establishment of IXPs in Canada.

[Session recording](#)

Other sessions of interest to the ccTLD community

LAC Space

The LAC Space at ICANN70 brought together the Latin American and Caribbean community to share regional news. The session opened with an update presented by three ICANN Directors. Lito Ibarra, León Sánchez and Patricio Poblete talked with the participants about the main issues being addressed by the Board of Directors.

LACTLD, LACNIC and LACRALO then reported on some of the projects that have been developed in recent months. First, Luis Arancibia, LACTLD's President, presented the Illegal Content Forum and shared with the community the scope and results of this regional initiative. Secondly, Kevon Swift, LACNIC's Head of Strategic Relations and Integration, informed about the most relevant updates on the IP Address Registry. He announced a study on the Internet's technical success factors to be carried out jointly with APNIC, the launching of a new edition of the Internet Governance course offered at LACNIC's Campus, and the implementation of LACNIC's Code of Conduct. Thirdly, Sergio Salinas Porto talked about the latest activities, webinars and courses carried out by LACRALO.

ICANN's policy team also participated in the LAC Space and had the opportunity to discuss with regional stakeholders some of the recommendations published in the Phase 2 Final Report on the Expedited Policy Development Process (EPDP) on the Temporary Specification for gTLD Registration Data.

Lastly, the session provided an opportunity to exchange information on courses, diploma courses and training opportunities with a regional focus.

[Session recording](#)

Discussions on DNS Abuse at ICANN70

The GNSO and the GAC convened a series of sessions on DNS abuse building on the discussions held at the last Public Meetings. During ICANN70, community members examined, in particular, the roles and responsibilities of technical operators; the implementation of a single trusted notifier program; the enforcement and compliance of ICANN's contracts with registries and registrars; and the promotion of cross-community work among Advisory Committees and Supporting Organizations.

Contracted Party House DNS Abuse Work Group Community Outreach

The GNSO session was organized by the Contracted Party House Working Groups on DNS Abuse to engage the community in an open dialogue, seek opportunities to collaborate, and understand the concerns of ICANN's Advisory Committees and Supporting Organizations. Panelists from the Registrar Stakeholder Group (RrSG) and Registries Stakeholder Group (RySG) shared with participants the definition of DNS abuse established by the Contracted Party House. They stated that DNS Abuse is composed of five broad categories of harmful activity insofar as they intersect with the DNS: malware, botnets, phishing, pharming, and spam (when it serves as a delivery mechanism for the other forms of DNS Abuse).

The members of the RrSG and RySG informed the community about a series of [documents](#) and whitepapers that have been recently published on the approaches, requirements, available actions and technical capabilities of technical operators. In addition, they announced that they are currently working on other papers that will be released soon. It is expected that these Working Group outputs and publications will help inform and foster dialogue among ICANN's Advisory Committees and Supporting Organizations.

The session convened by the GNSO Contracted Party House also featured an open discussion with the community on a number of key issues. Participants exchanged views on the differences between DNS abuse and other forms of abuse on the Internet; the roles and responsibilities of technical operators; trusted

notifier programs and engagement frameworks; the technical capabilities of registries and registrars; and ICANN's enforcement and compliance mechanisms. Finally, the RrSG and RySG members invited the community to continue the open dialogue in order to jointly prevent and mitigate DNS abuse.

[Session recording](#)

GAC Discussion on DNS Abuse Mitigation

The GAC held two sessions on DNS abuse during ICANN70. The first session focused on the Second Security, Stability, and Resiliency (SSR2) Review Team [Final Report](#). Panelists reviewed the recommendations with direct implications for DNS abuse and reported that the SSR2 Final Report was submitted to the ICANN Board of Directors and published for public comment.

The discussion among session participants covered the enforcement and compliance of ICANN's contracts with registries and registrars, and also reviewed some focal points for action identified as priorities by GAC members. Panelists noted the need to address the impact of DNS abuse and to overcome disagreements over statistics on the volume of domains used for malicious purposes. In addition, they proposed ensuring timely and effective response action; fostering information sharing; streamlining and standardizing abuse reporting to registries, registrars and other relevant parties; ensuring access to accurate gTLD registration data; and promoting user education.

During the first session convened by the GAC, the Public Safety Working Group (PSWG) also shared a number of proposals for cross-community action within ICANN. Working Group members suggested identifying specific topics with certain levels of consensus; developing financial incentive programs to reward effective prevention and mitigation; implementing a single trusted notifier program; improving existing contracts, tools and measures; and adopting ccTLD best practices in the gTLD space.

The second session on abuse mitigation organized by the GAC explored the developments and challenges related to DNS over HTTPS (DoH) and its implications for public safety. The panel discussion examined the deployment and standardization of DoH from the perspectives of a public DNS resolver, a web browser, and a Regional Internet Registry. The session reviewed various issues such as: industry adoption and deployment of DoH, configuration challenges associated with DNS resolvers, filtering and protection issues, and lawful access by law enforcement agencies.

[Session recording I](#)

[Session recording II](#)